

TRANSITIONAL MIGRANTS FROM HOSPITALITY TO HOSTILITY: UNDERSTANDING SETTLERS-INDIGENOUS RELATIONS IN HILLS OF MURREE

### Shamsa Waheed<sup>1</sup> & Abid Ghafoor Chaudhry<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>MPhil Scholar, Department of Anthropology, PMAS Arid Agriculture University, Pakistan <sup>2</sup>Chairman, Department of Anthropology, PMAS Arid Agriculture University, Pakistan

KEYWORDS	ABSTRACT
Indigenous, Conflicts, New Settlers, Internal Migration, Unregulated Settlement, Commercialization, Murree  ARTICLE HISTORY  Date of Submission: 10-04-2025 Date of Acceptance: 13-05-2025 Date of Publication: 18-05-2025	This study explores social, cultural, environmental conflicts and underlying causes of conflicts between indigenous communities and new settlers in Murree: Darya Gali, Pakistan. With increasing in-migration & unplanned settlement, tensions have emerged over land use, cultural practices and resource sharing by using a qualitative research design. The study delves into the socio-economic, cultural and environmental dimensions and how unplanned urbanization, influx of settlers has disrupted local conditions, strained resources and altered the social and environmental condition of the region. The key areas of inquiry include dispute over land ownership, competition of natural resources, haphazard construction & clash of cultural values. To identify the causes of conflicts, data was gathered through semi structured in-depth interviews and thematic analysis was used for more clarification. Thus, the researcher reveals the finding that the unregulated settlement patterns and commercialization have not only disrupted the ecological balance of the region but also strained the social cohesion within the community. This study contributes to the broader discourse on internal migration, environmental justice and sustainable development in mountain regions of Pakistan.
Corresponding Author	Shamsa Waheed
Email:	shamsaabbasi1116@gmail.com
DOI	https://doi.org/10.53664/JSSD/04-02-2025-08-96-105

### INTRODUCTION

The enormous urbanization in the Asia and Africa has led to substantial demographic shifts due to the population expansion. By 2050, approximately 5.6 billion humans are expected to have been urbanized (Montgomery, 2008). Socio economic development is driving an increase in demand for public infrastructure. Land acquisition from indigenous people is sometimes part of development

initiatives, which can result in force relocation and displacement of economic factors. The approach resulted in urban-to-urban movement, rural urban migration, destitute, joblessness, psychological harm and insecurities about food (Chen, Guo & Shirazi, 2017). Over the past two decades, around 200-300 million people are displaced or resettled globally (Yang & Qian, 2017). In the developing nations, lack of institutionalization, political turbulence, amateur or unskilled conduct and varying constitutional acts lead to economic, social, and ethical dilemma (Pereira, Singh & Mueller, 2011). One of the world's most populated country, Pakistan has a significant rate of urbanization (UNDP, 2019); where the colonial land administration system and rules passed down over generation (Raza, Baig & Jamil, 2015).

Pakistan citizens are guaranteed the right to purchased and own property under article 23 of the constitution (GOP,1973). Land provides not just physical but psychological strength and economic stability (Roy & Sowgat, 2020), however there are institutional flaws and other conflicts raise among indigenous and settlers in the Pothohar region of Pakistan and such kind of conflicts become the origin of social and financial insecurity in region so as compromising on the Sustainable Goal-11 aspires to change cities in more represented, secure and sustainable situation (Shafi, Ramos, Jain, Salman, Kamal, Shabbir & Rehman, 2023). The Ancient Greek terms "indo," which means within or inside, and "genus," which means birth or born and also race, are the roots of the term "indigenous." The word "native" or "born within" is etymological. It literally implies in English literature that any particular people, ethnic group, particular community may be described to indigenous in reference to a certain territory or location where they think they have ancestral tribal claims. In indigenous law the phrases "aboriginal," "native," "original," "first," and "hereditary owners" are used to identify indigenous populations.

Best (2006) defines that the indigenous status gives individuals the identification, recognition, affiliation, and significance they need to protect their group's interests, individually or collectively. The non-indigenes, wage war against host communities to protect themselves. According to (Jones, 2012), phrase indigenous population refers to basic or aboriginal inhabitants of European colonized territories, primarily America, Africa, Australasia and Asia. The first organized International Labor recognized the types of native people in international law in 1957. (Dowei, 2009), international Labor Convention describes indigenous people as tribal people who they are living in a separate country and having the different social, cultural and economic condition from the rest of national communities and whose class or status is completely consist of their own traditions and customs, consist of their own particular rules and regulations. Still, land serves as foundation for peace and war in any part of planet. Land conflicts occur in society in all over the world (UN-Habitat, 2020). They occur at multiple scales, from local disputes amid individual and communities to international border conflicts.

#### Research Objectives

- To explore the social and cultural tensions between the community members in Murree, Darya Gali.
- 2. To identify the root causes of conflicts between indigenous residents and new settlers in the study area.

#### Research Questions

- How the socio-economic condition of Murree, Darya Gali changed with the influx of new Settlers?
- 2. What are the primary causes of conflicts between indigenous residents and new settlers of Murree?
- 3. To examine that in what ways, have cultural differences contribute to the tension between them?
- 4. What role does play the natural resources in shaping the indigenous and new settlers' relationship?

### LITERATURE REVIEW

The roots of land conflicts usually lie in the historical unjustness, infirm legal framework and unfair extended system of land tenure (Heidenrich, Bouvier, Brooks, Green, Lawry & Sanjak, 2015) such as, many post-colonial nations facing conflicts from imposition of western property system that disregarded traditional or communal land practices (Cotula, 2013). Omeje (2008) explain security situation in Africa is intricately linked to formation of states. It is typical "catch-22" situation: state instability in Africa has led to wars that have further exacerbated underdevelopment and social & economic inequities that fuel more violence or lead to conflicts on state level. Land is significant asset, accounting for 30-50% of national wealth in emerging nations. (Deininger, Selod & Burns, 2010). Nwagwu (2016), stated that mistrust, distrust, fear of dominance & political marginalization would inevitably cause a nation that was founded on feelings of ethnic nations, archaic political philosophies and tactlessness on issues of national interest to fall apart. The least predicted behavior from a patriotic politician is to incite terrible conflicts between natives and settlers in order to win cheap political favor with populace. The government sustains the unresolvable issue of indigenous and settler people.

Land serves as a critical source for agriculture, culture identity and housing, making conflict over it deeply consequential (UN-Habitat, 2020). Murree is a tribal land but now it turns onto private ownership of new settlers. It is the prominent hill station in Punjab province, Pakistan has facing notable conflicts between indigenous communities and new settlers particularly in the areas like Darya Gali. During the previous few years, the visitors not only visited this hill station but now the land purchasing ratio is higher than because of some seasonal changes in the country. Still, long-lasting effect of climate change is undeniable in the world. Environmental factors, in general, cause migration (Bates, 2002). New settlers came in Northern areas & purchased land for accommodation and business purpose. People are expected to move due to environmental factors, like droughts (El-Hinawai, 1985). Like statement, history of migration is rife with inconsistent theories and evidences of conflicts (Fotheringham, Rees, Kalogirou & Tremayne, 2004). The migration alters community capital and adaptive possibilities to live in new region. The dynamic interplay between indigenous communities and new settlers has been a focal point in discourse of urbanization, land conflicts and resources distribution.

In Pakistan Murree, especially Darya Gali exemplifies the complexities of such kind of conflicts. As a prime tourist destination, it attracts many tourists, those who become a newsletter, came from

multiple backgrounds. The existing water resources are rapidly decreasing that creates the issues among population (Ahmed, 2011). These conflicts are not only rooted in land disputes but also stem from differences in cultural, resources and governance (Ali & Khan, 2021). New settlers also face many difficulties as well as bullying behavior. Naturally, the bullying behavior are predominantly psychological. Thus, the large-scale land disputes slow down the socioeconomic progress. In such disagreements, the landowner loses access to their holdings, eventually leaving the land behind (Muawanah, 2015). Resolving the land disputes requires proper frameworks, good governance and inclusive polices that address the need of all stakeholders and community members. International organizations: The United Nations and The Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) highlight the importance of land governance (Yeshanew, 2023). Addressing land disputes not only promotes social stability however, it contributes to reduce poverty reduction and sustainable development (World Bank, 2022).

According to Smyth and Robinson (2001), every public problem is ethicized until it turns into a major, unresolvable, ethno-religious conflict. Kandel (2016) stated in one of his articles that land dispossession and land disputes complicate resettlement attempts in post-conflict settings. The vast majority of livelihoods based on preserving access to cultivatable land in the rural areas of Sub-Saharan Africa. The academic work upon migrant hospitality/hostility dynamics emphasizes how hospitality and hostility are intertwined, especially where power asymmetries prevail. Teso was entangled in three violent battles that periodically overlapped: large-scale cattle rustling, a civil war and an insurgency from the late 1960s until the mid-2000s. Zreik (2016) explained if there is a conflict between two states than two-state solution should establish a framework for collaboration on the water, economics, transportation, environment, religious sites, and other concerns, fostering harmony that transcends divisions. These dynamics are rooted in systemic structures—property, race, and power not merely individual attitudes. Thus, settler colonialism is distinguished from the classic colonialism in that it not only manipulates resources, but forms colonies on freshly captured land additionally.

Mason and Spillman (2009), explain that the environmental degradation may lead to violence all over the world, especially when paired with specific political and socioeconomic situations. Such dispute can escalate into violence within a country, particularly when the political instability and poverty are present. However, international environmental conflicts are rarely the consequence of military action. Still, a lack of international collaboration over globally shared resources impedes their proper development, resulting in resource exploitation and underuse, as well as unmitigated natural disasters such as floods and droughts. These negative consequences, can be co-responsible for poverty, migration, and conflict that occur. Settler societies may perhaps take hospitality as governing principle but at last enforce hostility via exclusion, land appropriation, marginalization. These dynamics are embedded in gendered and racial terms, with local Indigenous communities less able to claim guest status and more subject to structural exclusion. Modern reconciliation efforts benefit from acknowledging this entanglement: unpacking historical hospitality and hostility, and addressing enduring legacies in ethical relational frameworks related to transitional justice, and inclusive narratives.

### **RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

The methodology adopted for this research aims to offer an in-depth understanding of the conflicts between indigenous communities and new settlers in Murree: NA 57 Darya Gali. A qualitative approach was employed, as it is well suited for exploring complex social phenomena, capturing nuanced perspectives and understanding the life experiencing of stakeholders involve (Cresswell, 2018). The study contains qualitative research design, relying primarily on in-depth interviews to collect data. Qualitative research allows the researcher for detailed exploration of social, cultural and economic issues. Furthermore, the purposive sampling approach was employed to pick the participant. Indigenous community members including elders, stakeholders and landowners, while, new settlers including developers & migrant families. Data was gathered by using semi-structured in-depth interviews.

This strategy was chosen because of its versatility in exploring the individuals (Bryman, 2016). The interviews were conducted in the native language (Pothohari) and Urdu so the participants could easily understand and express themselves freely. The collected data was transcribed and analyzed by using thematic analysis. In this connection, before conducting the interviews, the researcher informed the participants about the research's goal and obtained their agreement. All participants voluntary participates during the research time period. However, the researcher tried her best to maintain and respect the cultural norms as well as the traditions of the participants. Although, the qualitative research design provided rich insights, however, the study faced certain limitations. The findings may not be generalized on other regions. The research got access to some stakeholders and land owners.

#### **RESULTS & DISCUSSION**

Conflict is basically absence of peace. Johan Galtun, pioneer of peace research first introduce two basic concepts: positive peace and negative peace. According to him the negative peace is absence of conflict, violence and wars but positive peace, which is defined by durable peace, comprises of sustainable investment in economic growth and institutions. The positive peace basically provides the framework to understand and address the multifaceted challenges in any area. The influx of cyclic visitors transforming into new settlers in Murree, mainly in Darya Gali has created significant changes such as socio cultural, economic and environmental changes. However, conflict over land use is common, as the settlers construct the houses, commercial spaces, others lead to unregulated expansion and environmental degradation. The growing population increasing a heavy burden on healthcare and education system. The researcher highlights some root causes of conflicts between indigenous and new settlers with help of in-depth interviews from respondents. As per respondents the root causes of conflicts in Murree Union Council Darya Gali are socio-economic dynamics, land ownership conflicts, environmental issues, cultural and social dimensions, poor waste management and noise pollution.

### Socio-Economic Dynamics, Land Disputes & Unregulated Construction

The socio economic disparities between indigenous people and new settlers of Murree are central to these conflicts. Indigenous communities often depend on the traditional farming and small-scale trading. Conversely, new settlers are typically engaged in commercial ventures, including hotels,

guest houses, restaurants and real estate. Still, commercialization threw off region's socioeconomic equilibrium. Respondents stated that the commercialization of land in Murree, Darya Gali has led to dispossessions of indigenous communities. New settlers, leveraging legal ambiguities, acquire land through informal deals or coercion, however, some indigenous who belong to the real estate business involve in such kind of dealing or informal process. This process not only deprived the indigenous community of their ancestral lands but also eroded their cultural identity. Many locals argue that their rights over ancestral lands are being overlooked and negligence with the influx of wealthier settlers. The unchecked real estate development, especially after Murree's popularity as tourist's hub, has created dual land economy where settlers have great financial resources to bypass legal formalities.

#### **Environmental Concerns**

The commercialization of land having a bad impact of the environment and lush green areas. The environmental consequences of the settler indigenous conflicts are significant. Deforestation, water scarcity and soil erosion are rampant in the Murree due to unregulated construction by new settlers (Siddiqui et al., 2023). Increasing temperatures, shifting precipitation patterns, and increased frequency of extreme weather events all offer substantial changes for Pakistan's infrastructure and urban expansion (Shah et al., 2024). Same as new and unplanned building constructions donated to deforestation, waste management issues and depilation of the natural resources, which impact negatively on the ecosystem of the study area. The environmental degradation further exacerbates tensions as resources become increasingly scarce as well as environmental degradation and social inequality have significant impact on individual & public health globally (Tyagi, 2014). Indigenous residents lamented that the destruction of the natural beauty is being sacrificed for profit—driven motives revealing sharp tensions at the intersection of place, power, and belonging. Moreover, this unmanaged waste threatens the region's fragile ecology and adds pressure to an already limited municipal waste system. They admitted that few native residents do participate in such kind of the destruction activities.

#### **Cultural & Social Dimensions**

The cultural differences between indigenous group and new settlers have intensified the conflicts. Indigenous communities in Murree have unique traditions, language, social structures & boundaries. However, according to respondents new settlers not only emphases on commercial activities but they disrupt the lifestyle of the community by using alcohol, loud music and dance parties at night. Moreover, the erosion of traditional practices and values has led to a loss of cultural identity among indigenous groups. The indigenous community perceive the new settlers behavior such as organize loud night parties as disrespectful to their cultural norms, leading to a sense of alienation between natives and visitors. Indigenous of Murree often perceive new settlers as outsiders who lack respect for local traditions & communal norms. Besides, intergeneration transmission of cultural knowledge among indigenous people are reportedly disrupted. Older residents having concerned over language shifts, where local dialects such as Pahari are being replaced by Urdu and English among younger generation influenced by settlers' families. This form of cultural erosion was discussed by Ahmed and Gul (2019), as they said mountainous communities was linked to urban influences and land commodification.

### Noise Pollution & Waste Management

The influx of new settlers in Murree, the Union Council Darya Gali has significantly contributed to rising level of noise pollution & poor waste management. Unlike traditional lifestyle of indigenous community, which emphasized harmony with nature and sustainable practices, many newcomers bring urban habits that strain local infrastructure. Respondents reported frequent noise troubles from construction activities, vehicles and rental guesthouses, particularly during summer season. Dumping of junk has become a major issue of dispute among indigenous and new settlers in Union Council Darya Gali. Junk and loud music at night are frequent complaint by indigenous residents. They said settlers and tourists frequently dispose of the waste irresponsibly and it is all leading to unsanitary conditions and contaminated of natural water sources in Murree. They claimed that because of these kind of activities by new settlers their school going children cannot take proper sleep and they face difficulties in morning. Water scarcity is a critical issue in Union council Darya Gali, increased by urbanization & unregulated construction. Indigenous community claimed they are facing issues because new settlers disrupted water supplies lines. Environmental degradation not only reduce the quality of life for locals but also undermine Murree's status as an ecological and tourists' heritage sites.

#### CONCLUSION

The conflicts between indigenous communities and new settlers in Murree, NA 57 Darya Gali are macro issues associated with unplanned urbanization & socio-economic inequality. These conflicts underscore the needs for inclusive polices that respect the right of indigenous population while balancing demand of sustainable development and tourism. Addressing these challenges require multi-stakeholder approach to promote social inequity, environmental sustainability and cultural preservation. Addressing conflicts requires regulatory framework to manage urbanization defend the indigenous populations' rights and promote harmonious coexistence between local and new settlers. Some respondents claimed that the loud music at night time create disturbance and disrupt peaceful environment of Murree. The researcher highlights the key recommendations for resolving the conflicts, mutual understating and cooperation between indigenous and new settlers of Murree for long-term harmony.

#### Recommendations

- There should be a proper platform for get to gather (grand Jirga) where indigenous and new settlers sit together do table talk and resolve the issues. The elders or head of the community members can play a vital role to resolve the conflicts.
- Make groups in youth on the basic level, so they can run out an awareness campaign among
  the community as well as guide the new settlers properly and inspires them to involve them
  in the activities.
- The government policies should be balance that emphasizing should be given upon the sustainable development. Strict laws should be enforced to manage land use, construction and resource distribution.
- 4. Establish proper waste management teams including regular garbage collection, recycling points and awareness campaigns.

- There is a need to promote and protect indigenous culture and practices through festivals, language preservations and awareness program and invite the youth for promoting the culture and practices.
- 6. Form citizen led monitoring groups to report the illegal dumping, encroachments and other harmful practices for quick official action.

### **REFERENCES**

- Ahmad, B. (2011). Water Management: A solution to water scarcity in Pakistan. *JISR management and social sciences & economics*, 9(2), 111-125.
- Ahmed, S., & Gul, M. (2019). Cultural transformation in highland Pakistan: The case of Murree and surrounding areas. Lahore: National Institution of Social Research.
- Ali, R., & Khan, S. (2021). Urbanization and indigenous marginalization in Pakistan: A Case Study of Murree. *Islamabad Journal of Social Sciences*, 45(2), 112–128.
- Bates, D. C. (2002). The Environmental refugees? Classifying the human migrations caused by environmental change. *Population and environment*, 23, 465-477.
- Best, S. G. (Ed.). (2006). Introduction to peace and conflict studies in West Africa: A reader. Spectrum Books.
- Bryman, A. D. A. (2016). The Social Research Methods (5th Edition). The Oxford University Press.
- Chen, F., Guo, H., & Shirazi, Z. (2017). Disaster Risks and Response Strategies in Process of Urbanization in THE China. In contributing paper to GAR, World Economic Forum: Cologny, Geneva, Switzerland.
- Cotula, L. (2013). The great African land grab? Agricultural investments and the global food system. Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Cresswell, J. (2018). Qualitative Inquiry & Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches (4th ed.). Sage Publications.
- Deininger, K., Selod, H., & Burns, T. (2010). The land governance framework: methodology and early lessons from country pilots. *Innovations in land rights recognition, administration and governance*.
- Dowie, M. (2011). Conservation refugees: The hundred-year conflict between global conservation and native peoples. MIT press.
- Einarsen, S. (1999). The nature and causes of bullying at work. *International Journal of Manpower*, 20(1/2), 16–27.
- El-Hinnawi, E. (1985). The Environmental Refugees. United Nations Environment Program (UNEP) Nairobi, P41.
- Fotheringham, S., Rees, P., Champion, T., Kalogirou, S., & Tremayne, A. R. (2004). The development of migration model for England Wales: overview and modelling out-migration. *Environment and Planning*, 36(9), 1633–1672.
- Hansen, K. V., Sun, K. C. Y., & Osnowitz, D. (2017). Immigrants as settler colonists: boundary work between Dakota Indians and white immigrant settlers. *Ethnic and racial studies*, 40(11),1919–1938.
- Heidenrich, N. K., Bouvier, I., Brooks, S., Green, J., Lawry, G. M., & Sanjak, J. (2015). Land And Development: A Research Agenda for Land and Resource Governance at USAID.

- Indigenous Peoples. [Online] Available at: http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/indigenous\_peoples (02/10/2024).
- Jones, M. (2012). Playing the indigenous card? The Shetland and Orkney Udal Law group and indigenous rights. *Geo Journal*, 77, 765–775.
- Kandel, M. (2016). Struggling over land in post-conflict Uganda. African Affairs, 115(459), 274–295.
- L Perch-Nielsen, S., B Bättig, M., & Imboden, D. (2008). Exploring the link between climate change and migration. *Climatic change*, 91, 375–393.
- Mason, A., & Spillman, R. (2009). Environmental conflicts regional conflict management. Welfare economics and sustainable development, 2, 114-143.
- Montgomery, M. R. (2008). The urban transformation of the developing world. *science*, 319(5864), 761–764.
- Moon, W. (2005). Decomposition of regional voting in the South Korea: ideological conflicts and regional interests. *Party Politics*, 11(5), 579–599.
- Muawanah, U. (2015). Does the Land Conflict Matter to Farm Productivity? A Case Study of Cambodia. Asian Journal of Agriculture and Development, 15(2), 77-92.
- Nwagwu, E. J. (2016). Indigenes and settlers' conflict in Nigeria: a negation to national integration and nation building. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, 7(4), 218–227.
- Omeje, K. C. (2008). Understanding conflict resolution in Africa. *Peace and conflict in Africa*, 68–91.
- Pereira, C., Singh, S.P., & Mueller, B. (2011). Political institutions, policymaking, and policy stability in Latin America. Latin American Politics and Society, 53(1), 59–89.
- Raza, G., Baig, A., & Jamil, M. (2019). Urban expansion and infrastructure mismatches in periurban Pakistan: Evidence from the north. *Planning and Development Review*, 11(4), 88–102.
- Roy, S., & Sowgat, T. (2020). Dhaka: Diverse, dense, and damaged neighborhoods and the impacts of unplanned urbanisation. SHLC research summary, 8.
- Shafi, M., Ramos–Meza, C. S., Jain, V., Salman, A., Kamal, M., Shabbir, M. S., & Rehman, M. U. (2023). The dynamic relationship between green tax incentives and environmental protection. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 30(12), 32184–32192.
- Shah, S. K., Gao, Y., Ahmad, K., Khan, A., & Siddigui, N. (2024). Climate Change and Urban Planning in Pakistan Vulnerabilities, Impacts, and Mitigation Strategies. Impacts, and Mitigation Strategies. 1–21.
- Siddique, S., Chaudhry, M. N., Ahmad, S. R., Nazir, R., Zhao, Z., Javed, R., & Mahmood, A. (2023). Ecological and human health hazards; integrated risk assessment of organochlorine pesticides (OCPs) from the Chenab River, Pakistan. Science of the Total Environment, 882, 163504.
- Smyth, M., & Robinson, G. (2001). Researching violently divided societies. *The Ethical and methodological issues*. Tokyo: United Nations University.
- Tyagi, S., Garg, N., & Paudel, R. D. (2014). The Environmental degradation: The Causes and consequences. *European researcher*, 81(8–2), 1491.
- United Nations Development Program. (2019, May 8). Sustainable Urbanization: Pakistan has the highest rate of urbanization in South Asia [Report]. UNDP Pakistan.

- UN-Habitat. (2020). The Urban Land Housing and Property Rights. United Nations Human Settlements. Retrieved from <a href="http://unhabitat.org">http://unhabitat.org</a>
- United Nations Human Settlements Program. (2010). The state of African cities 2010: Governance, inequality and urban land markets. UN-HABITAT.
- World Bank. (2022). Land Governance Assessment Frame work: Implementation and Policy Recommendations. World Bank Group. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.worldbank.org">https://www.worldbank.org</a>
- Yang, C., & Qian, Z. (2021). 'Resettlement with Chinese characteristics': the distinctive political– economic context (in) voluntary urbanites, and three types of mismatches. *International Journal of Urban Sustainable Development*, 13(3), 496–515.
- Yeshanew, S. (2023). Rights in the collaboration between the World Bank and the United Nations in the areas of investment in agriculture, rural development and food systems. *The International Journal of Human Rights*, 27(7), 1086–1106.
- Zreik, R. (2016). When does a settler become native? (With apologies to Mamdani). Constellations: An International Journal of Critical & Democratic Theory, 23(3).